

COMPARISON OF 1ST GRADE PHONICS INSTRUCTION

2010

in new Reading programs approved for 2010 local Texas adoption

	<i>SRATexas</i> <i>IMAGINE IT!</i> (SRA/McGraw, 2010)	TEXAS TREASURES (Macmillan, 2011)	Scott Foresman Texas READING STREET (Pearson, 2011)	TEXAS JOURNEYS (Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2011)
decodability ¹	97%	93%	93%	93%
% of student reading selections that are at least 80% decodable	98% (310 of 316 selections)	93% (229 of 245 selections)	93% (435 of 469 selections)	90% (366 of 407 selections)
% of student reading selections that are at least 90% decodable	93% (294 of 316 selections)	80% (196 of 245 selections)	77% (359 of 469 selections)	80% (324 of 407 selections)
# of phonetically-IRREGULAR words taught as sight words	55	82	96	82
# of phonetically-REGULAR words taught as sight words <i>before</i> they are decodable	24	66	92	113
comprehensiveness ² ("LSCs" = letter-sound correspondences)	70 of 70 LSCs + 30 more	70 of 70 LSCs + 37 more	70 of 70 LSCs + 19 more	69 of 70 LSCs +20 more
strengths & weaknesses of comprehensiveness	Unique 14-week review after teaching 100 LSCs. Extra LSCs include schwa, long u spelled -ue, -ew; long oo spelled -ue, u, u_e; /aw/ spelled augh, ough; /er/ spelled ear; long e spelled -ey.	Teaches schwa. Teaches many of the extra LSCs only briefly. More-thoroughly taught extra LSCs include /or/ spelled oar, ore; long oo spelled u_e, u, -ue, ou; /âr/ spelled ear, are, air; /aw/ spelled augh.	Two of the more- thoroughly taught extra LSCs are /or/ spelled -ore and long oo spelled -ue or ui.	Extra LSCs include silent g, silent w, silent b after m; long oo spelled ou, u-e, u, -ue. Only program to omit a as in all
intensiveness ³	1,115 practice opportunities	1,162 practice opportunities	1,144 practice opportunities	822 practice opportunities
oral vocabulary alignment ⁴	yes	yes	yes	yes
overall ranking 👈	BEST	BETTER	BETTER	FAIR

Publishers tout teaching aids. We stress phonics content. Publishers tell you their strengths. We include their weaknesses. No textbook publisher funds us in any way. Unlike publisher sales reps, we have no monetary interest in any adoption. We have no financial stake in the textbook industry. Our support comes from individuals and a few small foundations, which to our knowledge have no ties to any textbook company.

Get full, fast, FREE documentation from:

¹ DECODABILITY: For each 1st grade reading selection, we added the phonetically-regular words, all of whose sounds have been taught, plus the phonetically-irregular words that have been taught, and divided by the total number of words. The figure shown here averages all those quotients.

² COMPREHENSIVENESS: We identified 70 letter-sound correspondences (LSCs) often taught in Grade 1, and found how many of these each program covers. We also list all additional LSCs each program teaches in Grade 1.

³ INTENSIVENESS: We counted how often each program has 1st graders practice (i.e., see, hear, say, and write) three LSCs in their introductory lessons, and also compared four randomly selected blending lessons. The figure shown here is the total for all seven exercises.

⁴ ALIGNMENT: We checked whether each program avoids asking 1s graders to recognize or "read" phonetically-regular "Oral Vocabulary" words before learning all their LSCs. (None of these programs' Reading and Writing components fully align with their Phonics strands.)