

COMPARISON OF 1ST GRADE PHONICS INSTRUCTION

in new Reading Program Type 1 materials up for 2009 local California adoption

	<i>SRA IMAGINE IT!</i> (SRA/McGraw, 2009)	<i>HOUGHTON MIFFLIN READING</i> (Houghton, 2010)	<i>PEARSON READING STREET</i> (Pearson, 2010)	<i>CALIFORNIA TREASURES</i> (Macmillan, 2010)	<i>HSP CALIFORNIA EXCURSIONS</i> (Harcourt, 2010)
decodability¹	95%	91%	89%	86%	87%
% of student reading selections that are at least 75% decodable	97% (185 of 190 selections)	96% (154 of 161 selections)	89% (215 of 242 selections)	88% (158 of 179 selections)	88% (242 of 275 selections)
% of student reading selections that are at least 90% decodable	91% (172 of 190 selections)	65% (104 of 161 selections)	67% (163 of 242 selections)	50% (89 of 179 selections)	52% (144 of 275 selections)
# of phonetically-IRREGULAR words taught as sight words	32	86	88	83	83
# of phonetically-REGULAR words taught as sight words <i>before</i> they are decodable	23	132	91	96	135
comprehensiveness² ("LSCs" = letter-sound correspondences)	70 of 70 LSCs + 28 more	65 of 70 LSCs + 16 more	68 of 70 LSCs + 14 more	67 of 70 LSCs + 23 more	61 of 70 LSCs + 13 more
strengths & weaknesses of comprehensiveness	<i>Unique 14-week review after teaching 98 LSCs; only program to teach schwa sound; teaches a as in all in week 6, & ea as in head in week 8</i>	Never teaches a as in all or words ending in -le	Teaches a as in all in week 13; teaches words ending in -le only in final week	Teaches silent e as in house, please, geese; teaches /ar/ as in bear, fair, share; final unit teaches a as in all; never teaches ea as in head	Teaches a as in all in week 8; only program to omit oi/oy, aw/au, & e-e = long e
intensiveness³	1,194 practice opportunities	941 practice opportunities	1,354 practice opportunities	1,028 practice opportunities	789 practice opportunities
alignment⁴	yes	no	no	yes	yes
overall ranking →	BEST	BETTER	FAIR	FAIR	FAIR

¹ DECODABILITY: For each 1st grade reading selection, we added the phonetically-regular words, all of whose sounds have been taught, plus the phonetically-irregular words that have been taught, and divided by the total number of words. The figure shown here averages all those quotients.

² COMPREHENSIVENESS: We identified 70 letter-sound correspondences (LSCs) often taught in Grade 1, and found how many of these each program covers. We also list all additional LSCs each program teaches in Grade 1.

³ INTENSIVENESS: We counted how often each program has 1st graders practice (i.e., see, hear, say, and write) three LSCs in their introductory lessons, and also compared four randomly selected blending lessons. The figure shown here is the total for all seven exercises.

⁴ ALIGNMENT: We checked whether each program avoids asking 1st graders to recognize or "read" phonetically-regular "Oral Vocabulary" words before learning all their LSCs. (None of these programs' Reading and Writing components fully align with their phonics strands.)

Get full, fast, FREE documentation from: